

# Index

## A

### accountability

- among funders, recipients, and constituents, 21–22
- as a challenge of foreign aid, 8–9

### accuracy, defining for audit results, 61

### Action Plan for the Prevention and Control of Deforestation in the Amazon, 101

### additionality, 68–69

### adjustment loans, waiving conditions on, 14

### administration, aid programs competing for people skilled in, 4

### administrative costs

- of aid to recipients in Vietnam, 5
- entailed by audit, 61
- reduced by an open contract, 71

### adverse events, financing and, 71

### agents, pool of mutually acceptable, 73

### agreement, for primary education, 45–46

### aid. *See* foreign aid

### Amazon Fund, in Brazil, 100–101

### ambiguity, less with COD Aid, 22

### analysis, research strategies at two levels of, 78

### arbitration

- process for, 63
- required for COD Aid agreements, 73

### arbitration committee, 73, 113

### assessed completers

- assigning a unique identification number, 60

- calculating number of additional, 53
- COD Aid contract outline, 47
- consequences of overstating, 62
- defined, 114
- determining additional, 53
- disclosure of, 59
- drawing attention to content and quality of schooling, 49
- encouraging development of management information and testing systems, 50–51
- independent audit of number of, 59–62
- measuring progress by number of, 48–53
- number
  - of additional, 55
  - of easily defined, 48–49
- relatively easy to audit, 49–50
- as unit of progress, 46
- assessments
  - COD Aid fostering, 25
  - standards-based, 50
- asymmetric information, effect on local production function, 9
- attendance, maximizing for a retest, 60
- attribution, confirming in research, 81
- auditing, number of assessed completers, 49–50
- auditors, preapproved list of mutually acceptable, 20
- audits, role of independent, 59–62
- average test scores. *See also* test(s)
  - consequences of overstating, 62
  - disclosure of, 59
  - sample size necessary to estimate, 61

## B

- Bangalore, India, citizen report card, 58
- baseline
  - for calculating payment, 55
  - establishing for process approach, 82
  - of students completing primary school, 53
- baseline data, overestimating, 98
- bilateral agencies, offering COD Aid, 72
- Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation, 70
- binding constraints, recipients addressing, 24
- borrower-recipient, in a COD Aid agreement, 69

Brazil, emissions as a result of deforestation, 101  
Brazilian Development Bank, 101  
budget support  
    loans, 11  
    multiple performance and progress measures of, 38  
    reducing administrative burden on recipient governments, 7  
    requiring substantial ongoing funder scrutiny, 7  
    support programs, 37–38  
budgets, allocating, 90  
buy-downs, trust fund established for, 70

## C

carbon emissions, aid for reducing, 100  
Cash on Delivery Aid. *See* COD (Cash on Delivery) Aid  
cash transfer programs, conditional, 37  
causation, confirming in research on a COD Aid agreement, 81  
central governments, making financial transfers to other levels of government, 87  
cheating, on test performance increasing the cost of auditing, 52  
child support grants, disparities and declines in South Africa, 58  
citizen report card, in Bangalore, India, 58  
civil society organizations, emerging to advocate for better education, 94  
COD (Cash on Delivery) Aid  
    advantages of, 21–30  
    affecting funder and recipient behaviors, 76  
    agreements  
        analysis of validity of, 83  
        challenges of implementing and financing, 74  
        choosing a simple incentive, 64  
        clarifying accountability of each level of government, 88  
        contingency provisions, 62–63  
        in the education sector, 46, 47  
        between funders and recipients, 112–114  
        funding, 67–71  
        implementation of, 71–74  
        influence of various actors on, 80  
        institutions and initiatives to support or administer, 72  
        issues regarding funding and implementing, 67–74  
        keeping simple, 63–65  
        on primary education, 111  
        requiring arbitration, 73

- requiring information on progress, 93
- role of third parties in, 73–74
- specification of education goals, 114–115
- supporting other ways of verifying progress, 65
- transparent reporting and verification, 55, 58–62
- using existing expertise to develop, 65
- ways to implement, 72
- applications of, 17
- basics of, 18
- benefits of, 26
- building on other results-based aid programs, 36–38
- changing roles of funders and recipients, 23
- characteristics of, 39
- compared to budget support, 38
- complementary to other aid programs, 18, 19
- complementing budget support, 29, 38
- concerns and risks, 30–35
- contract elements, 45
- contracts
  - described, 17
  - elements for COD Aid, 20
  - less ambiguous for COD Aid, 21–22
  - levels of disclosure, 59
  - outline to pay for assessed completers, 47
  - public nature and transparency of, 55
  - raising matching private money or borrowing against, 31–32
  - term sheets and schedules for, 111–117
- coordinating actions of official funders, 27–28
- core of, 17
- displacing other aid programs, 30, 68
- effectiveness, 27–30, 76
  - as extreme innovation, 75
  - as feasible, 63, 95
- foreign assistance along principles of, 97
- fostering accountability, 21–22
- GAVI compared to, 36
  - as a global compact, 28
- initiative, research accompanying, 76–79
- as an intranational fiscal transfer, 89
- introducing change, 26

- judging based on strengths and weaknesses, 69
  - key features, 18–20, 45
  - meetings and events with discussions of, 12, 13
  - as more predictable, 38
  - moving to, 39
  - as needed in foreign aid, 39
  - operating at macro level, 37
  - as part of an existing multilateral initiative, 72
  - as a possible approach to reform, 13–14
  - programs, main challenges for, 97
  - risks, 30–35
  - solutions to bureaucratic rigidities, 68
  - steps, 20
  - success of, 40, 78
  - as too little, too late, 31
  - unintended consequences of, 32
  - using for transfers between a variety of actors, 17
  - waste and corruption and, 33–34
- comparative case approach, to research on COD Aid agreement, 83
- comparative work, entailing isolating relevant policy reform initiatives, 82
- comparators, as similar to and different from COD Aid agreement, 82
- competition, generated by overlapping constituencies, 88
- completion with a five-year lag, as the baseline, 53
- conditionality
- introduction to, 6
  - policy-based loans with, 11
- consequences, of COD Aid, 32
- constituencies, overlap of generating competition, 88
- contingencies, provision for in COD Aid agreement, 62–63
- contracts. *See* COD (Cash on Delivery) Aid, contracts
- corruption, COD Aid encouraging, 33–34
- cost-reimbursement contract, 10, 11
- costs. *See also* administrative costs
- of arbitration procedure, 73
  - of audits, 61
  - paying for test development and implementation, 52
- counterfactuals, establishing in impact evaluation design, 77
- countries
- encouraging self-selection by, 71
  - policies, vetting of, 72

receiving more than 10 percent of GDP in aid, 25  
country-by-country approach, to COD Aid, 28  
criticism, of foreign aid, 4, 6

## D

data quality audit, required by GAVI, 98  
decisionmakers, process approach requiring access to, 82  
deforestation, in developing countries, 101  
delays, in applying tests and submitting reports, 71  
deliverables, paying fixed prices for, 11  
democracy, promoting, 102  
demographic variation, under a COD agreement, 94  
developing countries  
    COD Aid payments to, 56–57  
    COD Aid working in most low income, 25–26  
    deforestation in, 101  
    ownership by, 12  
development, foreign aid undermining, 4–5  
Development Assistance Committee Network on Development Evaluation, 41  
disaggregation level, in a COD Aid contract, 59  
disclosure, levels of required in a COD Aid contract, 59  
dissemination, public, 49  
divergent objectives, of funders and recipients, 9  
diversion of resources, caused by COD Aid, 32  
domestic researchers, insights and experiences of, 85  
DTP-3 (diphtheria, tetanus, and pertussis), 36, 98

## E

economic recession, effect on foreign aid, 3  
education. *See also* primary education; upper secondary education, COD Aid in international aid to, 31  
education data, incentives to improve, 59  
education goal, for a COD Aid agreement, 114  
education sector  
    applying COD Aid for goals beyond primary completion, 97  
    COD (Cash on Delivery) Aid agreement, 46, 47  
education system, facilitating public debate about, 49  
Emergency Fund for AIDS Relief (PEPFAR), 98–99  
empirical equating, 50  
ENLACE (*Evaluación Nacional del Logro Académico en Centros Escolares*), 93

environment, improving and preserving, 100–101  
escrow, placing funds in, 68  
European Commission, performance-linked budget support, 38  
European Union, budget support to other governments, 6  
*Evaluación Nacional del Logro Académico en Centros Escolares* (ENLACE), 93  
exchange rates, inflated by aid inflows, 4  
exit, problem of, 14  
experimentation, COD Aid fostering, 25  
expertise, using existing, 65  
external shocks, 35  
external validity, confirming in research, 81

## F

Fast Track Initiative for Education, 72  
federal government (Mexico)  
    auditing state government accounts, 95  
    improvements in upper secondary schools, 89–90  
    programs addressing challenges, 90–91  
Financial Accountability reports, of the World Bank, 33  
financial arrangements, for a COD Aid agreement, 67–68  
financial rewards, staking on test performance, 52  
financing, adverse events and, 71  
fiscal transfers, from central governments, 87  
fixed-price contract, 10, 11, 12  
foreign aid  
    as a big and difficult business, 3  
    challenges to, 3  
    commitments, abiding by all existing, 69  
    compared to intranational fiscal transfers, 88  
    cost-reimbursement approach used for, 10–11  
    criticism of, 4, 6  
    as difficult to do well, 8–10  
    efforts to reform, 6–8  
    failure to disburse, 35  
    growth of, 3, 4  
    modalities, influence on institutions and governance, 80  
    modifying for legitimate or illegitimate goals, 9  
    necessity to generate measurable progress, 3  
    new approach, 38–40  
    predictability of, 8

- principal-agent problem in, 10–14
- programs, COD Aid displacing, 30
- scaling up, 29–30
- steering away from specific projects, 6
- system
  - articulating and reforming, 8
  - failings of current, 5
  - shortcomings of current, 4
  - undermining local institutional development, 87
- foreign researchers, perspectives and experiences of, 85
- fragile states
  - COD Aid in, 25–26
  - limitation of aid to, 14
  - with new and effective leaders, 26
  - reasons for success of COD Aid, 26
- funder-recipient relationships, altering in COD Aid, 17
- funders. *See also* private funders; public funders
  - accountability, 21
  - aid programs weakly accountable to, 8–9
  - baseline information, collection and analysis, 78
  - coordination, 27–28, 29
  - cost overruns, risking, 11
  - costs, covering direct, 20
  - countries, rewarding well performing, 68
  - discipline, 27
  - hands-off approach in COD Aid, 19
  - implementing agencies, compared to, 67
  - number of, increase in, 9
  - number of fragmenting public support for aid, 3
  - objectives of, 79
  - outcomes, incentives to invest in good data on, 25
  - principal-agent model, behavior under, 79–80
- recipients
  - agreement with, 112–114
  - compensating for cost of testing, 54
  - not precluded from engaging, 74
  - undermining decision making of, 23
- reducing administrative burden on, reducing, 29
- roles changed by COD Aid, 23
- test development, providing financial resources for, 51

tradeoffs of, 39  
types of, 67  
verification agent, contract with, 116

funding  
COD Aid agreements, 67–71  
pooled from many sources, 73

## G

Germany, projects in Tanzania (2007), 29  
Global Alliance for Vaccines and Immunisation (GAVI), 36, 98  
global compact, COD Aid as, 28  
Global Partnership on Output-Based Aid, of the World Bank, 100  
global price, 54  
goal  
as an essential element of a COD Aid contract, 45–46  
of universal primary completion, 46–48  
government, as accountable to foreign funders, 4  
government performance, clear measures of, 7  
government programs, scope for good quantitative analyses, 77  
grant funding, to eradicate polio, 70  
grantor, in a COD Aid agreement, 69  
grants  
in COD Aid, 69–71  
conditions for, 6

## H

health sector, applying COD Aid to, 98–100  
HIV/AIDS  
approach to treating and preventing, 99  
prevention policies, funds diverted from in Mexico, 58

## I

immunization coverage, baseline in Kenya, 98  
immunization programs, expanding and improving, 36  
Immunization Services Support program, 98  
implementation  
of COD Aid agreements, 71–74  
tracing, 84  
implementers, process approach requiring access to, 82  
implementing agencies, distinguished from funders, 67

- incentive(s)
  - choosing a simple, 64
  - payment of \$200 per student as sufficient, 54
  - power of, 19
  - providing sums substantial enough, 54–55
- incentive structure, influence of, 75
- incidence rate, directly measuring, 99
- incremental measures of progress, paying against, 38
- incremental payment, 36
- independent audit, in COD Aid, 20
- independent third party, COD Aid verified by, 38
- independent verification, for COD Aid progress, 19
- indicators
  - linking payments to overall performance, 37
  - outcome, 99–100
  - simple versus sophisticated, 64
- information, asymmetry of between federal and state, 87
- information systems
  - as core requirement of good governance, 26
  - reimbursing for creating, 32
- infrastructure, expanding and improving, 100
- innovation
  - documenting and evaluating, 75
  - inducing, 34
- Innovation Fund. *See also* Upper Secondary Education Innovation Fund, proposed for Fast Track Initiative, 73
- innovative approaches, fragile states responding to, 26
- inputs, federal and state programs focusing on, 90
- institution-building, COD Aid encouraging, 23
- interests, divergence between federal and state, 87
- International Development Association (IDA), 70
- International Development Department and Associates (2006) report, 41
- international programs, private giving for, 3
- interviews
  - with important actors in the process, 83
  - prior to implementation of COD Aid agreement, 82
- intranational fiscal transfers
  - compared to foreign, 87
  - feasible approach for, 95
  - officials on both sides accountable, 88

investments, providing funds for initial, 31  
Ireland, projects in Tanzania (2007), 29

## J

Joint Evaluation of General Budget Support, 41

## L

*Laboratorio Latinoamericano* student assessments, language arts test, 89  
learning, standardized test of, 50  
learning by doing, 25  
lender, in a COD Aid agreement, 69  
loans  
    buying down, 70  
    in COD Aid, 69–71  
    conditions for, 6  
local capacity, building, 23  
local ownership, of policies and programs, 22  
local production function, effect of asymmetric information on, 9

## M

macro level, COD Aid attracting, 37  
management, aid programs competing for people skilled in, 4  
management information and testing systems, encouraging, 50–51  
MDG Contracts, European Community's, 102  
measurement instruments, 50  
measures, of government performance, 7  
methodologies, studying implementation of a policy, 84  
*Mexicanos Primero*, 94, 95  
Mexico  
    advantages facilitating COD approach, 94  
    funds diverted from HIV/AIDS prevention policies, 58  
    upper secondary education in, 89–95  
Millennium Challenge Account funds, 68  
Millennium Challenge Corporation, 72  
Millennium Development Goals  
    commitment to, 3, 14  
    universal primary education as one, 46  
multilateral agency, 72  
multilateral initiative, in the education sector, 72

**N**

- narrative, testing against alternative explanations, 81–82
- national identification number, 60
- national learning assessments, 50–51
- nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), 21
- nonprofit initiatives, freedom to engage with, 24
- Norway, projects in Tanzania (2007), 29
- Norwegian government, first contributor to Amazon Fund, 101

**O**

- objectives
  - of budget support programs, 37
  - divergence between funders and recipients, 9
  - of funders, 79
- official aid, 3, 14. *See also* foreign aid
- official aid system, changing, 35
- open contract, 71
- outcome indicators, 99–100
- outcome measure, verifying, 73
- outcomes
  - focusing on, 5
  - funder's ability to report on, 27
  - linking foreign assistance to, 21
  - measuring for COD Aid, 20, 34, 35
  - reporting, 21, 35, 52
  - specifying, 11
- output-based aid, 36–37
- outputs, paying for, 37

**P**

- Paris Declaration (2005), 8, 27, 39
- payments
  - attaching to average scores, 91
  - basing on number of children taking exam, 52
  - in COD Aid, 20
  - conditions for, 115
  - determining size of, 53–55, 56, 57
  - to a developing country, 56–57
  - elaborating on the structure of, 64
  - formula for calculating, 55

- for implementing testing, 54, 55
- related to overall performance, 37
- relaxing constraints, 53
- timing of, 115
- performance
  - clear measures of government, 7
  - focusing on results and outcomes, 8
  - of students in upper secondary school, 90, 93–94
- performance audit, required for COD Aid, 19
- philanthropic foundations, concerned with education in Mexico, 94
- pilot experiences, differing from subsequent efforts, 84
- policy conditionality loans, 11
- policy dialogue, as demand-driven, 74
- policy-based loans, 7, 11
- polycymaking, evidence base for effective, 50
- polio transmission worldwide, campaign to eliminate, 70
- political risks, of COD Aid, 35
- pooled fund, for COD Aid, 28
- Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper, 6, 38
- prevalence rate, for HIV/AIDS, 99
- primary education, applying COD Aid to, 45–74
- primary school, completing, 48
- principal-agent model, 79
- principal-agent problem
  - between federal and state governments, 87
  - in foreign aid, 10–14
- private and nonprofit initiatives, freedom to engage with, 24
- private funders, COD Aid attracting, 27
- prize money, treating COD Aid funds as, 68
- prize system, proportional-reward, 34
- prizes, structuring payment as, 35
- process approach, 81–85
- process conditions, as an approach to foreign aid, 6
- process tracing, 83
- program inputs, focusing on, 5
- Programme for International Student Assessment, 61, 66
- progress. *See also* unit of progress
  - measures of, 11
  - measuring and verifying, 46
  - overestimating, 98

- public reports of, 55, 58
- unit of, 20
- verifying for COD Aid, 19
- ways of verifying, 65
- proportional-reward prize system, 34
- public audit reports, 62
- public contract, accepting, 39
- Public Expenditure Reports, of the World Bank, 33
- Public Expenditure Reviews, of the World Bank, 33
- public financial accountability, standards for, 33
- public funders, budget cycles precluding long term commitments, 67–68
- public scrutiny, encouraging, 19
- public services, disseminating information about, 58
- public-private partnership, for progress, 73

## Q

- quality improvement, in education, 97

## R

- raw data, disclosure to researchers, 59
- recipients
  - accountable primarily to funders under budget support, 38
  - administrative burden on, 9
  - aid programs and policies weakly accountable to, 9
  - bearing less risk under cost-reimbursement contracts, 11
  - behavior under principal-agent model, 80
  - COD Aid agreement with funders, 112–114
  - COD Aid giving more discretion to, 24
  - COD Aid making more accountable to citizens, 21
  - collection and analysis of baseline information on, 78
  - as composite of many actors, 80
  - directing funding to better-off areas or groups, 32
  - with discretion and responsibility in COD Aid, 19
  - factors beyond control of, 35
  - failure to make progress as problematic for, 35
  - focus on response of, 78
  - funders weakly accountable to, 9
  - incentives to invest in good data on outcomes, 25
  - maximizing effectiveness of programs, 29
  - measuring outcomes, 20

- negotiating COD Aid for, 28
  - ownership by, 12
  - paying for successful public programs, 33
  - reducing administrative burden on, 27, 28, 29
  - responsibility and discretion for COD Aid, 22–25
  - responsibility fostering local involvement and accountability, 24
  - resulting actions affecting actual outcomes, 76
  - rewarding for progress when success is due to other causes, 33
  - roles changed by COD Aid, 23
  - taking action to progress, 20
  - tradeoffs of, 39
  - using local knowledge to assess technical assistance, 24
- reforms, in the Paris Declaration, 8
- reporting
- for COD Aid agreement, 55, 58–62
  - effectiveness and credibility of, 94
- reports, delays in submitting, 71
- research
- framework, 76
  - implementing COD Aid, 20
  - levels of, 76–79
  - methodology, 81
  - methods, 81
  - opportunities, 76
  - process approach, 81–85
  - purpose of, 76–79
  - strategies, 78, 79
  - unit of analysis for, 81
- research team, qualifications for, 85–86
- researchers
- including both foreign and domestic, 85
  - as very familiar with the country, 82
- responsibility, benefits generated by recipient, 23
- results-based aid programs, building on, 36–38
- results-based approaches, for health sector grants, 102
- retest, of random sample of schools, 60
- revenue collection, aid reducing incentives, 4
- reward shares, 98
- risk, viewing lack of disbursements as, 35
- risks, for political leaders, 55

Rotary International/United Nations Foundation, buying down IDA loans, 70

## S

samples, tests based on representative, 50

school enrollment, expanding at expense of quality, 32

schooling, quality, 49

schools, retesting a random sample of, 60–61

self-discovery, aid interrupting, 5

shared information, lack of, 10

simplicity, principles of, 64

social audits, 55, 58

sophisticated indicators, 64

South Africa, 58, 59

Southern African Consortium for Monitoring Educational Quality, 66

stakeholders, effects of new policies and programs on, 84

standardized testing, introducing, 97

standards-based assessments, 50

state governments, in Mexico, 89

states (Mexico)

- as subnational entities, 95
- use of funds by, 94

statistical comparisons, in research, 81

statistics, improving quality of, 101–102

student completions and test scores, payments for, 92–93

students

- purposes of testing, 51
- unique identifying number for each, 60

surveys, revealing understanding of new education strategy, 84

Sweden, projects in Tanzania (2007), 29

## T

Tanzania, number of projects by donor (2007), 29

targets, specifying, 11

technical assistance, as demand-driven, 24, 74

technical support, contracting for, 51

term sheets

- development of, 111
- model, 112–117

test(s)

- care in using, 51–52

- design and administration, 59
- development and implementation, 52
- permitting delays in applying, 71
- teaching to, 51
- test scores
  - conditioning payments on, 52
  - validity of, 51–52
- testing
  - initial payments for implementing, 54, 55
  - measuring what society wants children to learn, 51
  - payments to implement, 55
- tied aid, 5, 79
- tradeoffs, of moving to COD Aid, 39
- transaction costs, of foreign aid system, 5
- transparency
  - achieved by COD Aid, 19
  - COD Aid requiring, 21
  - increased by an open contract, 71
  - increasing, 102
  - promoted by a global compact, 28
- 2005 Paris Declaration, 8, 27, 39

## U

- Uganda, community-based monitoring of health care, 58
- U.K. Department for International Development, 68
- U.K. government, providing budget support to other governments, 6
- UN Millennium Declaration, universalizing primary school, 46
- uniform payment, in a global compact, 28
- unique identification, required for an accurate audit, 60
- unit of analysis, for research, 81
- unit of progress, 20, 46, 48–53, 93
- United States, projects in Tanzania (2007), 29
- universal primary completion, 46–48
- upfront funding, COD Aid exclusion of, 32
- upper secondary education, in Mexico, 89–90
- Upper Secondary Education Innovation Fund, 90, 91
- upper secondary schools (Mexico)
  - COD Aid working, 91–95
  - graduation rate from, 89
  - poor performance in, 90

student completion and performance in, 93–94  
U.S. Millennium Challenge Account, 22, 41

## V

validity of test scores, 51–52  
variable tranche, of EC budget support, 38  
verification, for COD Aid agreement, 55, 58–62  
verification agent  
    compensation of, 116  
    contract with funders, 116  
    described, 111  
    duties of, 112–113, 114, 115, 117  
verification report, specification of, 117  
Vietnam, administrative costs of aid to recipients, 5  
vital statistics, COD Aid agreement aimed at improving, 102  
volatility, in foreign aid, 5

## W

waste, COD and, 33–34  
windfall payments, under COD Aid, 33  
working group, funder and recipient establishing, 76–77  
World Bank  
    allocating concessional funding, 6  
    Global Partnership on Output-Based Aid, 100  
    implementing polio eradication programs, 70  
    technical advisory services from, 40