A

accountability
  among funders, recipients, and constituents, 21–22
  as a challenge of foreign aid, 8–9
accuracy, defining for audit results, 61
Action Plan for the Prevention and Control of Deforestation in the Amazon, 101
additionality, 68–69
adjustment loans, waiving conditions on, 14
administration, aid programs competing for people skilled in, 4
administrative costs
  of aid to recipients in Vietnam, 5
  entailed by audit, 61
    reduced by an open contract, 71
adverse events, financing and, 71
agents, pool of mutually acceptable, 73
agreement, for primary education, 45–46
aid. See foreign aid
Amazon Fund, in Brazil, 100–101
ambiguity, less with COD Aid, 22
analysis, research strategies at two levels of, 78
arbitration
  process for, 63
    required for COD Aid agreements, 73
arbitration committee, 73, 113
assessed completers
  assigning a unique identification number, 60
calculating number of additional, 53
COD Aid contract outline, 47
consequences of overstating, 62
defined, 114
determining additional, 53
disclosure of, 59
drawing attention to content and quality of schooling, 49
encouraging development of management information and testing systems, 50–51
independent audit of number of, 59–62
measuring progress by number of, 48–53
number
  of additional, 55
  of easily defined, 48–49
  relatively easy to audit, 49–50
  as unit of progress, 46
assessments
  COD Aid fostering, 25
  standards-based, 50
asymmetric information, effect on local production function, 9
attendance, maximizing for a retest, 60
attribution, confirming in research, 81
auditing, number of assessed completers, 49–50
auditors, preapproved list of mutually acceptable, 20
audits, role of independent, 59–62
average test scores. See also test(s)
  consequences of overstating, 62
disclosure of, 59
  sample size necessary to estimate, 61

B
Bangalore, India, citizen report card, 58
baseline
  for calculating payment, 55
  establishing for process approach, 82
  of students completing primary school, 53
baseline data, overestimating, 98
bilateral agencies, offering COD Aid, 72
Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation, 70
binding constraints, recipients addressing, 24
borrower-recipient, in a COD Aid agreement, 69
Brazil, emissions as a result of deforestation, 101
Brazilian Development Bank, 101
budget support
  loans, 11
  multiple performance and progress measures of, 38
  reducing administrative burden on recipient governments, 7
  requiring substantial ongoing funder scrutiny, 7
  support programs, 37–38
budgets, allocating, 90
buy-downs, trust fund established for, 70

C

carbon emissions, aid for reducing, 100
Cash on Delivery Aid. See COD (Cash on Delivery) Aid
cash transfer programs, conditional, 37
causation, confirming in research on a COD Aid agreement, 81
central governments, making financial transfers to other levels of government, 87
cheating, on test performance increasing the cost of auditing, 52
child support grants, disparities and declines in South Africa, 58
citizen report card, in Bangalore, India, 58
civil society organizations, emerging to advocate for better education, 94
COD (Cash on Delivery) Aid
  advantages of, 21–30
  affecting funder and recipient behaviors, 76
agreements
  analysis of validity of, 83
  challenges of implementing and financing, 74
  choosing a simple incentive, 64
  clarifying accountability of each level of government, 88
  contingency provisions, 62–63
  in the education sector, 46, 47
  between funders and recipients, 112–114
  funding, 67–71
  implementation of, 71–74
  influence of various actors on, 80
  institutions and initiatives to support or administer, 72
  issues regarding funding and implementing, 67–74
  keeping simple, 63–65
  on primary education, 111
  requiring arbitration, 73
requiring information on progress, 93
role of third parties in, 73–74
specification of education goals, 114–115
supporting other ways of verifying progress, 65
transparent reporting and verification, 55, 58–62
using existing expertise to develop, 65
ways to implement, 72
applications of, 17
basics of, 18
benefits of, 26
building on other results-based aid programs, 36–38
changing roles of funders and recipients, 23
characteristics of, 39
compared to budget support, 38
complementary to other aid programs, 18, 19
complementing budget support, 29, 38
concerns and risks, 30–35
contract elements, 45
contracts
described, 17
elements for COD Aid, 20
less ambiguous for COD Aid, 21–22
levels of disclosure, 59
outline to pay for assessed completers, 47
public nature and transparency of, 55
raising matching private money or borrowing against, 31–32
term sheets and schedules for, 111–117
coordinating actions of official funders, 27–28
core of, 17
displacing other aid programs, 30, 68
effectiveness, 27–30, 76
as extreme innovation, 75
as feasible, 63, 95
foreign assistance along principles of, 97
fostering accountability, 21–22
GAVI compared to, 36
as a global compact, 28
initiative, research accompanying, 76–79
as an intranational fiscal transfer, 89
introducing change, 26
judging based on strengths and weaknesses, 69
key features, 18–20, 45
meetings and events with discussions of, 12, 13
as more predictable, 38
moving to, 39
as needed in foreign aid, 39
operating at macro level, 37
as part of an existing multilateral initiative, 72
as a possible approach to reform, 13–14
programs, main challenges for, 97
risks, 30–35
solutions to bureaucratic rigidities, 68
steps, 20
success of, 40, 78
as too little, too late, 31
unintended consequences of, 32
using for transfers between a variety of actors, 17
waste and corruption and, 33–34
comparative case approach, to research on COD Aid agreement, 83
comparative work, entailing isolating relevant policy reform initiatives, 82
comparators, as similar to and different from COD Aid agreement, 82
competition, generated by overlapping constituencies, 88
completion with a five-year lag, as the baseline, 53
conditionality
introduction to, 6
policy-based loans with, 11
consequences, of COD Aid, 32
constituencies, overlap of generating competition, 88
contingencies, provision for in COD Aid agreement, 62–63
contracts. See COD (Cash on Delivery) Aid, contracts
corruption, COD Aid encouraging, 33–34
cost-reimbursement contract, 10, 11
costs. See also administrative costs
of arbitration procedure, 73
of audits, 61
paying for test development and implementation, 52
counterfactuals, establishing in impact evaluation design, 77
countries
encouraging self-selection by, 71
policies, vetting of, 72
receiving more than 10 percent of GDP in aid, 25
country-by-country approach, to COD Aid, 28
criticism, of foreign aid, 4, 6

D
data quality audit, required by GAVI, 98
decisionmakers, process approach requiring access to, 82
deforestation, in developing countries, 101
delays, in applying tests and submitting reports, 71
deliverables, paying fixed prices for, 11
democracy, promoting, 102
demographic variation, under a COD agreement, 94
developing countries
   COD Aid payments to, 56–57
   COD Aid working in most low income, 25–26
deforestation in, 101
   ownership by, 12
devolution, foreign aid undermining, 4–5
Development Assistance Committee Network on Development Evaluation, 41
disaggregation level, in a COD Aid contract, 59
disclosure, levels of required in a COD Aid contract, 59
dissemination, public, 49
divergent objectives, of funders and recipients, 9
diversion of resources, caused by COD Aid, 32
domestic researchers, insights and experiences of, 85
DTP-3 (diphtheria, tetanus, and pertussis), 36, 98

E
economic recession, effect on foreign aid, 3
education. See also primary education; upper secondary education, COD Aid in international aid
to, 31
education data, incentives to improve, 59
education goal, for a COD Aid agreement, 114
education sector
   applying COD Aid for goals beyond primary completion, 97
   COD (Cash on Delivery) Aid agreement, 46, 47
education system, facilitating public debate about, 49
Emergency Fund for AIDS Relief (PEPFAR), 98–99
empirical equating, 50
ENLACE (Evaluación Nacional del Logro Académico en Centros Escolares), 93
environment, improving and preserving, 100–101
escrow, placing funds in, 68
European Commission, performance-linked budget support, 38
European Union, budget support to other governments, 6
*Evaluación Nacional del Logro Académico en Centros Escolares* (ENLACE), 93
exchange rates, inflated by aid inflows, 4
exit, problem of, 14
experimentation, COD Aid fostering, 25
expertise, using existing, 65
external shocks, 35
external validity, confirming in research, 81

**F**

Fast Track Initiative for Education, 72
federal government (Mexico)
  - auditing state government accounts, 95
  - improvements in upper secondary schools, 89–90
  - programs addressing challenges, 90–91
Financial Accountability reports, of the World Bank, 33
financial arrangements, for a COD Aid agreement, 67–68
financial rewards, staking on test performance, 52
financing, adverse events and, 71
fiscal transfers, from central governments, 87
fixed-price contract, 10, 11, 12
foreign aid
  - as a big and difficult business, 3
  - challenges to, 3
  - commitments, abiding by all existing, 69
  - compared to intranational fiscal transfers, 88
  - cost-reimbursement approach used for, 10–11
  - criticism of, 4, 6
  - as difficult to do well, 8–10
  - efforts to reform, 6–8
  - failure to disburse, 35
  - growth of, 3, 4
  - modalities, influence on institutions and governance, 80
  - modifying for legitimate or illegitimate goals, 9
  - necessity to generate measurable progress, 3
  - new approach, 38–40
  - predictability of, 8
principal-agent problem in, 10–14
programs, COD Aid displacing, 30
scaling up, 29–30
steering away from specific projects, 6
system
   articulating and reforming, 8
   failings of current, 5
   shortcomings of current, 4
   undermining local institutional development, 87
foreign researchers, perspectives and experiences of, 85
fragile states
   COD Aid in, 25–26
   limitation of aid to, 14
   with new and effective leaders, 26
   reasons for success of COD Aid, 26
funder-recipient relationships, altering in COD Aid, 17
funders. See also private funders; public funders
   accountability, 21
   aid programs weakly accountable to, 8–9
   baseline information, collection and analysis, 78
   coordination, 27–28, 29
   cost overruns, risking, 11
   costs, covering direct, 20
   countries, rewarding well performing, 68
   discipline, 27
   hands-off approach in COD Aid, 19
   implementing agencies, compared to, 67
   number of, increase in, 9
   number of fragmenting public support for aid, 3
   objectives of, 79
   outcomes, incentives to invest in good data on, 25
   principal-agent model, behavior under, 79–80
   recipients
      agreement with, 112–114
      compensating for cost of testing, 54
      not precluded from engaging, 74
      undermining decision making of, 23
   reducing administrative burden on, reducing, 29
   roles changed by COD Aid, 23
   test development, providing financial resources for, 51
tradeoffs of, 39
  types of, 67
  verification agent, contract with, 116
funding
  COD Aid agreements, 67–71
  pooled from many sources, 73

G
Germany, projects in Tanzania (2007), 29
Global Alliance for Vaccines and Immunisation (GAVI), 36, 98
global compact, COD Aid as, 28
Global Partnership on Output-Based Aid, of the World Bank, 100
global price, 54
goal
  as an essential element of a COD Aid contract, 45–46
  of universal primary completion, 46–48
government, as accountable to foreign funders, 4
government performance, clear measures of, 7
government programs, scope for good quantitative analyses, 77
grant funding, to eradicate polio, 70
grantor, in a COD Aid agreement, 69
grants
  in COD Aid, 69–71
  conditions for, 6

H
health sector, applying COD Aid to, 98–100
HIV/AIDS
  approach to treating and preventing, 99
  prevention policies, funds diverted from in Mexico, 58

I
immunization coverage, baseline in Kenya, 98
immunization programs, expanding and improving, 36
Immunization Services Support program, 98
implementation
  of COD Aid agreements, 71–74
  tracing, 84
implementers, process approach requiring access to, 82
implementing agencies, distinguished from funders, 67
incentive(s)
  choosing a simple, 64
  payment of $200 per student as sufficient, 54
  power of, 19
  providing sums substantial enough, 54–55
incentive structure, influence of, 75
incidence rate, directly measuring, 99
incremental measures of progress, paying against, 38
incremental payment, 36
independent audit, in COD Aid, 20
independent third party, COD Aid verified by, 38
independent verification, for COD Aid progress, 19
indicators
  linking payments to overall performance, 37
  outcome, 99–100
  simple versus sophisticated, 64
information, asymmetry of between federal and state, 87
information systems
  as core requirement of good governance, 26
  reimbursing for creating, 32
infrastructure, expanding and improving, 100
innovation
  documenting and evaluating, 75
  inducing, 34
Innovation Fund. See also Upper Secondary Education Innovation Fund, proposed for Fast Track Initiative, 73
innovative approaches, fragile states responding to, 26
inputs, federal and state programs focusing on, 90
institution-building, COD Aid encouraging, 23
interests, divergence between federal and state, 87
International Development Association (IDA), 70
International Development Department and Associates (2006) report, 41
international programs, private giving for, 3
interviews
  with important actors in the process, 83
  prior to implementation of COD Aid agreement, 82
intranational fiscal transfers
  compared to foreign, 87
  feasible approach for, 95
  officials on both sides accountable, 88
investments, providing funds for initial, 31
Ireland, projects in Tanzania (2007), 29

J
Joint Evaluation of General Budget Support, 41

L
Laboratorio Latinoamericano student assessments, language arts test, 89
learning, standardized test of, 50
learning by doing, 25
lender, in a COD Aid agreement, 69
loans
   buying down, 70
   in COD Aid, 69–71
   conditions for, 6
local capacity, building, 23
local ownership, of policies and programs, 22
local production function, effect of asymmetric information on, 9

M
macro level, COD Aid attracting, 37
management, aid programs competing for people skilled in, 4
management information and testing systems, encouraging, 50–51
MDG Contracts, European Community’s, 102
measurement instruments, 50
measures, of government performance, 7
methodologies, studying implementation of a policy, 84
Mexicanos Primero, 94, 95
Mexico
   advantages facilitating COD approach, 94
   funds diverted from HIV/AIDS prevention policies, 58
   upper secondary education in, 89–95
Millennium Challenge Account funds, 68
Millennium Challenge Corporation, 72
Millennium Development Goals
   commitment to, 3, 14
   universal primary education as one, 46
multilateral agency, 72
multilateral initiative, in the education sector, 72
N
narrative, testing against alternative explanations, 81–82
national identification number, 60
national learning assessments, 50–51
nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), 21
nonprofit initiatives, freedom to engage with, 24
Norway, projects in Tanzania (2007), 29
Norwegian government, first contributor to Amazon Fund, 101

O
objectives
  of budget support programs, 37
  divergence between funders and recipients, 9
  of funders, 79
official aid, 3, 14. See also foreign aid
official aid system, changing, 35
open contract, 71
outcome indicators, 99–100
outcome measure, verifying, 73
outcomes
  focusing on, 5
  funder’s ability to report on, 27
  linking foreign assistance to, 21
  measuring for COD Aid, 20, 34, 35
  reporting, 21, 35, 52
  specifying, 11
output-based aid, 36–37
outputs, paying for, 37

P
Paris Declaration (2005), 8, 27, 39
payments
  attaching to average scores, 91
  basing on number of children taking exam, 52
  in COD Aid, 20
  conditions for, 115
  determining size of, 53–55, 56, 57
  to a developing country, 56–57
  elaborating on the structure of, 64
  formula for calculating, 55
Index

for implementing testing, 54, 55
related to overall performance, 37
relaxing constraints, 53
timing of, 115

performance
clear measures of government, 7
focusing on results and outcomes, 8
of students in upper secondary school, 90, 93–94

performance audit, required for COD Aid, 19
philanthropic foundations, concerned with education in Mexico, 94
pilot experiences, differing from subsequent efforts, 84
policy conditionality loans, 11
policy dialogue, as demand-driven, 74
policy-based loans, 7, 11
policymaking, evidence base for effective, 50
polio transmission worldwide, campaign to eliminate, 70
political risks, of COD Aid, 35
pooled fund, for COD Aid, 28
Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper, 6, 38
prevalence rate, for HIV/AIDS, 99
primary education, applying COD Aid to, 45–74
primary school, completing, 48
principal-agent model, 79
principal-agent problem
between federal and state governments, 87
in foreign aid, 10–14
private and nonprofit initiatives, freedom to engage with, 24
private funders, COD Aid attracting, 27
prize money, treating COD Aid funds as, 68
prize system, proportional-reward, 34
prizes, structuring payment as, 35
process approach, 81–85
process conditions, as an approach to foreign aid, 6
process tracing, 83
program inputs, focusing on, 5
Programme for International Student Assessment, 61, 66
progress. See also unit of progress
measures of, 11
measuring and verifying, 46
overestimating, 98
public reports of, 55, 58
unit of, 20
verifying for COD Aid, 19
ways of verifying, 65
proportional-reward prize system, 34
public audit reports, 62
public contract, accepting, 39
Public Expenditure Reports, of the World Bank, 33
Public Expenditure Reviews, of the World Bank, 33
public financial accountability, standards for, 33
public funders, budget cycles precluding long term commitments, 67–68
public scrutiny, encouraging, 19
public services, disseminating information about, 58
public-private partnership, for progress, 73

Q
quality improvement, in education, 97

R
raw data, disclosure to researchers, 59
recipients
accountable primarily to funders under budget support, 38
administrative burden on, 9
aid programs and policies weakly accountable to, 9
bearing less risk under cost-reimbursement contracts, 11
behavior under principal-agent model, 80
COD Aid agreement with funders, 112–114
COD Aid giving more discretion to, 24
COD Aid making more accountable to citizens, 21
collection and analysis of baseline information on, 78
as composite of many actors, 80
directing funding to better-off areas or groups, 32
with discretion and responsibility in COD Aid, 19
factors beyond control of, 35
failure to make progress as problematic for, 35
focus on response of, 78
funders weakly accountable to, 9
incentives to invest in good data on outcomes, 25
maximizing effectiveness of programs, 29
measuring outcomes, 20
negotiating COD Aid for, 28
ownership by, 12
paying for successful public programs, 33
reducing administrative burden on, 27, 28, 29
responsibility and discretion for COD Aid, 22–25
responsibility fostering local involvement and accountability, 24
resulting actions affecting actual outcomes, 76
rewarding for progress when success is due to other causes, 33
roles changed by COD Aid, 23
taking action to progress, 20
tradeoffs of, 39
using local knowledge to assess technical assistance, 24
reforms, in the Paris Declaration, 8
reporting
for COD Aid agreement, 55, 58–62
effectiveness and credibility of, 94
reports, delays in submitting, 71
research
framework, 76
implementing COD Aid, 20
levels of, 76–79
methodology, 81
methods, 81
opportunities, 76
process approach, 81–85
purpose of, 76–79
strategies, 78, 79
unit of analysis for, 81
research team, qualifications for, 85–86
researchers
including both foreign and domestic, 85
as very familiar with the country, 82
responsibility, benefits generated by recipient, 23
results-based aid programs, building on, 36–38
results-based approaches, for health sector grants, 102
retest, of random sample of schools, 60
revenue collection, aid reducing incentives, 4
reward shares, 98
risk, viewing lack of disbursements as, 35
risks, for political leaders, 55
Rotary International/United Nations Foundation, buying down IDA loans, 70

**S**
samples, tests based on representative, 50
school enrollment, expanding at expense of quality, 32
schooling, quality, 49
schools, retesting a random sample of, 60–61
self-discovery, aid interrupting, 5
shared information, lack of, 10
simplicity, principles of, 64
social audits, 55, 58
sophisticated indicators, 64
South Africa, 58, 59
Southern African Consortium for Monitoring Educational Quality, 66
stakeholders, effects of new policies and programs on, 84
standardized testing, introducing, 97
standards-based assessments, 50
state governments, in Mexico, 89
states (Mexico)
  as subnational entities, 95
  use of funds by, 94
statistical comparisons, in research, 81
statistics, improving quality of, 101–102
student completions and test scores, payments for, 92–93
students
  purposes of testing, 51
  unique identifying number for each, 60
surveys, revealing understanding of new education strategy, 84
Sweden, projects in Tanzania (2007), 29

**T**
Tanzania, number of projects by donor (2007), 29
targets, specifying, 11
technical assistance, as demand-driven, 24, 74
technical support, contracting for, 51
term sheets
  development of, 111
  model, 112–117
test(s)
  care in using, 51–52
design and administration, 59
development and implementation, 52
permitting delays in applying, 71
teaching to, 51
test scores
  conditioning payments on, 52
  validity of, 51–52
testing
  initial payments for implementing, 54, 55
  measuring what society wants children to learn, 51
  payments to implement, 55
tied aid, 5, 79
tradeoffs, of moving to COD Aid, 39
transaction costs, of foreign aid system, 5
transparency
  achieved by COD Aid, 19
  COD Aid requiring, 21
  increased by an open contract, 71
  increasing, 102
  promoted by a global compact, 28
2005 Paris Declaration, 8, 27, 39

U
Uganda, community-based monitoring of health care, 58
U.K. Department for International Development, 68
U.K. government, providing budget support to other governments, 6
UN Millennium Declaration, universalizing primary school, 46
uniform payment, in a global compact, 28
unique identification, required for an accurate audit, 60
unit of analysis, for research, 81
unit of progress, 20, 46, 48–53, 93
United States, projects in Tanzania (2007), 29
universal primary completion, 46–48
upfront funding, COD Aid exclusion of, 32
upper secondary education, in Mexico, 89–90
Upper Secondary Education Innovation Fund, 90, 91
upper secondary schools (Mexico)
  COD Aid working, 91–95
  graduation rate from, 89
  poor performance in, 90
student completion and performance in, 93–94
U.S. Millennium Challenge Account, 22, 41

V
validity of test scores, 51–52
variable tranche, of EC budget support, 38
verification, for COD Aid agreement, 55, 58–62
verification agent
   compensation of, 116
   contract with funders, 116
   described, 111
   duties of, 112–113, 114, 115, 117
verification report, specification of, 117
Vietnam, administrative costs of aid to recipients, 5
vital statistics, COD Aid agreement aimed at improving, 102
volatility, in foreign aid, 5

W
waste, COD and, 33–34
windfall payments, under COD Aid, 33
working group, funder and recipient establishing, 76–77
World Bank
   allocating concessional funding, 6
   Global Partnership on Output-Based Aid, 100
   implementing polio eradication programs, 70
   technical advisory services from, 40